Value Dimensions of Culture and National Difference

Shalom H. Schwartz
The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel
Bergen, Norway
November 2006
You’re probably asking yourself, what can we learn about different cultures. Well.....
Overview of Questions

- Are there universal dimensions on which to compare cultures?
- Where do such dimensions come from?
- Theory of 3 cultural value dimensions
- Characterizing & comparing 74 national cultures & world cultural regions
- Alternative approaches—same world?
Types of Country Differences

- Basic Cultural Orientations
  - Fundamental ways of defining reality
  - Underlying, taken-for-granted normative system
- Prevailing value emphases in society express cultural orientations most directly
- Values are underlying conceptions of good & desirable (e.g., success, justice, freedom, order)
Prevailing value emphases

- Value emphases are expressed in daily practices, ways of thinking and ways institutions function.

- Value emphases generate, justify and support societal institutions
  - ambition & success → competitive legal, market, education systems

- Value emphases are implicit standards: evaluate and promote actions, norms, policies in everyday settings
  - modesty & obedience ↔ widespread conformity norms and behavior
Evolution of Cultural Value Emphases

- All societies confront basic problems in regulating human activity

- Societal responses to basic problems emphasize certain values and sacrifice others (cf. Inglehart, Hofstede)

- Derive 3 bipolar cultural value dimensions/orientations from societal responses to 3 problems
CULTURAL DIMENSIONS: PROTOTYPICAL STRUCTURE

- HARMONY
  - Unity with Nature
  - World at Peace

- EMBEDDEDNESS
  - Social Order, Obedience
  - Respect for Tradition

- EGALITARIANISM
  - Social Justice
  - Equality

- INTELLECTUAL AUTONOMY
  - Broadmindedness
  - Curiosity

- IDEAL INDIVIDUAL / GROUP RELATIONSHIP

- HIERARCHY
  - Authority
  - Humble

- MASTERY
  - Ambition
  - Daring

- AFFECTIVE AUTONOMY
  - Pleasure
  - Exciting Life

- Individuals independent actors

- People: role players embedded in groups
CULTURAL DIMENSIONS: PROTOTYPICAL STRUCTURE

- **Harmony**: Unity with Nature
  - World at Peace

- **Egalitarianism**: Social Justice
  - Equality

- **Autonomy**: Broadmindedness
  - Curiosity

- **Affective Autonomy**: Pleasure
  - Exciting Life

- **Mastery**: Ambition
  - Daring

- **Hierarchy**: Authority
  - Humble

- **Embeddness**: World at Peace
  - Social Order, Obedience
  - Respect for Tradition

- **Ideal way to elicit productive, cooperative, activity in society**

Socialize: Others morally equal transcend selfish interests cooperate voluntarily

Hierarchical allocation roles/resources legitimate/desirable
CULTURAL DIMENSIONS: PROTOTYPICAL STRUCTURE

- **HARMONY**: Unity with Nature, World at Peace
- **EMBEDDEDNESS**: Social Order, Obedience, Respect for Tradition
- **HIERARCHY**: Authority, Humble
- **EGALITARIANISM**: Social Justice, Equality
- **INTELLECTUAL AUTONOMY**: Broadmindedness, Curiosity
- **AFFECTIVE AUTONOMY**: Pleasure, Exciting Life
- **MASTERY**: Ambition, Daring

**Regulate use of human and natural resources**

- fit harmoniously, avoid change & self-assertion
- master, control, change through assertive action
Measuring Cultural Value Orientations

- Cultural value orientations shape contingencies to which individuals adapt in daily life
- Help determine the individual behaviors, attitudes, and value preferences likely to be
  - viewed as more or less legitimate
  - encouraged or discouraged
- Hence individuals
  - share many value-relevant experiences
  - socialized to take for granted shared social values

*Average of value priorities of all individuals*
Data and Sources

- 57 Item Values Questionnaire
  - 45 value items with equivalent meaning in within-country analyses
  - items chosen a priori to index each of 7 cultural orientations cluster in cross-national analysis
- Data from dominant cultural group: teachers & students in most countries—average increase reliability
- 76 cultural groups, 74 countries, N=43,135
- All inhabited continents, represent 79% world pop.

http://isdc.huji.ac.il/ehold10.shtml#E2
Measurement: SVS

"What values are important to ME as guiding principles in MY life, and what values are less important to me?"

AS A GUIDING PRINCIPLE IN MY LIFE, this value is:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>opposite to my values</th>
<th>not important</th>
<th>important</th>
<th>very important</th>
<th>supreme importance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Before you begin, choose one that is most important to you ....one that is most opposed to your values.... [self-anchoring]

1 ____EQUALITY (equal opportunity for all)

2 ____INNER HARMONY (at peace with myself)

3 ____SOCIAL POWER (control over others, dominance)

Center on own mean of 57, eliminate individual scale location effect

Center country scores on mean of 7 orientations, eliminate mean country differences and within country social comparison effects
Mapping National Cultures

- Compute cultural distances between all pairs of cultural groups
  - Sum absolute distances on each of 7 orientations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Orientation</th>
<th>Har</th>
<th>Emb</th>
<th>Hier</th>
<th>Mas</th>
<th>AfAu</th>
<th>InAu</th>
<th>Ega</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distance</td>
<td>.6</td>
<td>-.2</td>
<td>-2.0</td>
<td>-.5</td>
<td>.4</td>
<td>.5</td>
<td>.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Norway & China: Sum of distances = 5.1
- Create 76 x 76 matrix with cultural distances in cells
- Map countries by distances in 2 dimensional space
Comparing Culture Maps

- Inglehart 2 dimensions, 75 countries
- Inglehart & Schwartz maps very similar
  - Despite different methods & samples
  - Separate East European Orth, East European Prot & R. Cath, West European, Confucian, English Spkg, Latin American, African, Southeast Asian regions
- **Capture real phenomenon**
- Ing 2 dimensions, Schw 7 orientations—fine tuning
## Correlates of National Differences in Cultural Value Dimensions I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Hofstede (n=62)</th>
<th>Inglehart (n=62)</th>
<th>Government Quality n=74</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Power Distance</td>
<td>- .63**</td>
<td>.59**</td>
<td>.55**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individualism</td>
<td>.58**</td>
<td>.64**</td>
<td>.74**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tradition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sec-Rat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survival</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slf-Expr</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Security</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corruption</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accountability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy – Embeddedness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmony – Mastery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egalitarianism – Hierarchy</td>
<td>-.38*</td>
<td>.51*</td>
<td>.31*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.51**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.62**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p<.01, **p<.001, ^p<.05, 2-tailed; #controlled for GDPpc85
### Correlates of National Differences in Cultural Value Dimensions II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>GDPpc '85</th>
<th>Family Size '85</th>
<th>Democracy '80-90</th>
<th>Protestant</th>
<th>Roman Catholic</th>
<th>Islam</th>
<th>Eastern</th>
<th>Tribal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N=76</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy – Embeddedness</td>
<td>.60**</td>
<td>-.71**</td>
<td>.59**</td>
<td>.39**</td>
<td>.32*</td>
<td>-.47**</td>
<td>-.42**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egalitarianism - Hierarchy</td>
<td>.43**</td>
<td>-.61**</td>
<td>.54**</td>
<td>.31*</td>
<td>.35*</td>
<td></td>
<td>-.50**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmony - Mastery</td>
<td></td>
<td>-.41**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.35*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p<.01,  **p<.001, 2-tailed

#times military acts primary response in foreign policy crisis 1945-2001: correlation with Harmony-Mastery (N=52), control GNI 2000 = .45**
Conclusions

- Cultural value orientations can be inferred from mean values of individuals in societies.
- World composed of cultural regions, linked by history, geography, economics, religion, etc.
- Same regions with different methods: REAL
- Knowing *HOW* cultures differ gives tools for specific analysis of issues in international contact (conflict, management, trade, aid, immigration).
- Cultural value orientations relate in reciprocal causality with key social structural, political, & demographic features of society.
- Cultural value orientations probably influence important societal policies and practices.
Some References


Thank you

Gracias

Excapri

merci

thank you

Thank you

Koszonom

Inn dekhui
Countries as a Cultural Unit

• Is the country a legitimate cultural unit?
  - Countries are rarely homogeneous—subcultures based on ethnicity, age, religion, gender, etc.
  - Findings may depend on subgroup sampled
  - Forces for integration in established countries -- market, school, government, symbols
  - If we use matched samples across countries, do they order nations same way on each dimension?
## Countries as Cultural Units: Empirical Tests

Correlations between Subgroups across Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural Dimension</th>
<th>Age &lt;37 / 37+ (42 countries)</th>
<th>Male / Female (44 countries)</th>
<th>Teachers/Students (52 countries)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Harmony</td>
<td>.94</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td>.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embeddedness</td>
<td>.96</td>
<td>.96</td>
<td>.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hierarchy</td>
<td>.94</td>
<td>.88</td>
<td>.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mastery</td>
<td>.83</td>
<td>.85</td>
<td>.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aff Autonomy</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>.91</td>
<td>.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Int Autonomy</td>
<td>.91</td>
<td>.96</td>
<td>.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egalitarianism</td>
<td>.92</td>
<td>.90</td>
<td>.88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Culture Level MDS of Value Items

HARMONY
- Protect Environment
- Unity with Nature
- Respect Tradition
- Forgiving
- Social Order

EMBEDDEDNESS
- World of Beauty
- Social at Peace
- Self
- Family
- Discipline
- SecuritY

EGALITARIANISM
- Helpful
- Social Justice
- Obedient
- Politeness
- Wisconsin

HONEST
- Equal
- Loyal
- Devout
- Discipline Security

RESPONSIBLE
- Loyalty
- Clean
- Protect My Public Image

BROADMINDEDNESS
- Freedom
- Creativity

INTELLECTUAL AUTONOMY
- Curious
- Exciting Life
- Varied Life
- Choosing
- Social Recognition

INFLUENTIAL
- Capable
- Successful
- Independent Influential
- Social Recognition

SUCCESSFUL
- Authoritative
- Wealth
- Social Power

WEALTH
- Courageous
- Reciprocal
- Favors

INDEPENDENT
- Choosing
- Protect My Favors

HIERARCHY
- Capable
- Successful
- Authoritative
- Wealth

MASTERY
- Daring
- Reciprocal
- Favors

Pleasure
- Choosing
- Protect My Favors

VALUE ITEMS
- Accept My Portion in Life
- Harmony
- Embeddedness
- Equality
- Moderate
- Honor Elders
- National Security
- Forgiving
- Social Order
- Self
- Family
- Social at Peace
- World of Beauty
- Respect Tradition
- Obedient
- Politeness
- Diversity
- Loyalty
- Devout
- Discipline
- SecuritY
- Freedom
- Creativity
- Curious
- Exciting Life
- Varied Life
- Choosing
- Social Recognition
- Authoritative
- Wealth
- Social Power
- Courageous
- Reciprocal
- Favors
- Own Goals
- Pleasure
- Daring
- Reciprocal
- Favors

CULTURE LEVEL
- Accept My Portion in Life
- Harmony
- Embeddedness
- Equality
- Moderate
- Honor Elders
- National Security
- Forgiving
- Social Order
- Self
- Family
- Social at Peace
- World of Beauty
- Respect Tradition
- Obedient
- Politeness
- Diversity
- Loyalty
- Devout
- Discipline
- SecuritY
- Freedom
- Creativity
- Curious
- Exciting Life
- Varied Life
- Choosing
- Social Recognition
- Authoritative
- Wealth
- Social Power
- Courageous
- Reciprocal
- Favors
- Own Goals
- Pleasure
- Daring
- Reciprocal
- Favors
Cultural Map of Europe-Mid 90’s, Anchored
## Contrasting Hofstede & Schwartz Dimensions

### Autonomy/Embeddedness & Individualism/Collectivism $r=.44$ (n=60)

Share: Concern for relationship between individual and collective and contrast autonomous with interdependent view of person, but

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Autonomy/Embeddedness</th>
<th>Individualism/Collectivism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• opposes openness to change with maintaining status quo</td>
<td>• not present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• selfishness/selflessness not inherent</td>
<td>• self-interested pursuit of personal goals</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Hierarchy/Egalitarianism and Power Distance $r=.31$

Share: Concern for legitimizing social inequality, but

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hierarchy/Egalitarianism</th>
<th>Power Distance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Hierarchy of ascribed roles as way to assure responsible behavior</td>
<td>• not relevant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Egalitarianism: voluntary cooperation, concern for other’s welfare</td>
<td>• not relevant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• not relevant</td>
<td>• not relevant to low PD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• acceptance of inequality by less</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contrasting Hofstede & Schwartz Dimensions

### Mastery and Masculinity \( r = .08 \)
Share: Emphasis on assertiveness, activity, and ambition, but

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mastery</th>
<th>Masculinity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• selfishness not inherent</td>
<td>• neglect or rejection of others’ interests implied by contrast with femininity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Harmony and Uncertainty Avoidance \( r = .26 \)
Share: Harmonious order as ideal, but

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Harmony</th>
<th>Uncertainty Avoidance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• live harmoniously by fitting in, not exerting control</td>
<td>• control unpredictability &amp; ambiguity by active structuring (rules, regulations)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Are individuals good culture informants?

- Individuals have unique experiences, unique genetic makeup & personality
  - Hence individual differences in personal values
  - But individual differences do not affect average

- Average reflects exposure to same culture

- Cultural orientations are implicit, not known

- Discern them from their effects on values of individuals
Cultural Value Dimensions I

**Autonomy vs. Embeddedness**

Issue: Relations between individual and group

- **Autonomy**: Promote and protect individual's independent pursuit of own:
  - `[Intellectual]` ideas and own intellectual directions.
  - `[Affective]` affectively positive experience.

- **Embeddedness**: Identify with group & its goals, maintain group traditions & solidarity, restrain potentially disruptive actions

Some Values

- **IntAut**: curious broadminded creativity
- **AffAut**: pleasure exciting life varied life
- **Emb**: social order obedience respect tradition, self-discipline
Cultural Value Dimensions II

Egalitarianism vs. Hierarchy

Issue: Elicit cooperative, productive activity to manage interdependencies

- **EGALITARIANISM:** Socializing individuals to accept others as morally equal, transcend selfish interests, & cooperate voluntarily is desirable way to regulate interdependencies

- **HIERARCHY:** A hierarchical, differential allocation of fixed roles and of resources is the legitimate, desirable way to regulate interdependencies

Some Values

- **Egal:** equality, social justice, honesty, loyalty, responsibility

- **Hier:** authority, social power, wealth, humility
Cultural Value Dimensions III

**Harmony vs. Mastery**

Issue: Regulate use of human and natural resources

- **HARMONY**: Groups and individuals should fit harmoniously into the natural and social world, avoiding change and self-assertion to modify them.

- **MASTERY**: Groups and individuals should master, control, and change the social and natural environment through assertive action.

Some Values

- **Har**: world at peace, unity with nature, protecting environment

- **Mast**: ambition, daring, success, influence